

**WILLIAMSBURG
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
Tuesday, April 10, 2007**

The regular semi-monthly meeting of the Williamsburg Architectural Review Board was held on Tuesday, April 10, 2007 at 6:30 p.m. in the Williamsburg Municipal Building, 401 Lafayette Street.

CALL TO ORDER AND ATTENDANCE

Vice-Chairman Quarles called the meeting to order. Present in addition to Mr. Quarles were Board members Messrs. Edwards, Hertzler, Lane and Kent. Absent were Board members Spence and Klee. Staff members Deputy Planning Director Murphy and Secretary Scott were present.

Consent Agenda

Vice-Chairman Quarles explained the consent agenda procedure to the audience stating that if an application is in full compliance with the ***Design Review Guidelines***, it is placed on the consent agenda. If no member of the Board has any question regarding the application and concurs that it is in full compliance with the *Guidelines*, the audience is asked if they are present to discuss any case on the Consent Agenda. If there is no one in the audience present to discuss any item on the Consent Agenda, those applications are approved as submitted and the applicants dismissed without further discussion.

Applications on tonight's Consent Agenda:

ARB #07-018 Bloom's/1234 Richmond Road – Exterior Change (add door and window)

ARB #07-027 Three Olives Restaurant/1203 Richmond Road – Addition (patio)

ARB #07-028 Sheraton Four Points/351 York Street – Renovate entrance canopy to restaurant

SIGN #07-013 Sherran/Sotheby's International Realty – Freestanding Sign

SIGN #07-014 Katherine Circle Apartments/321 Dunning Street – Freestanding Sign

SIGN #07-015 Patriot Inn & Suites/1420 Richmond Road – Monument & Building Mounted Signs

SIGN #07-016 6 Crabs Seafood/118 Second Street – Monument Sign

SIGN #07-018 Rita's/220-D Monticello Avenue – Building Mounted Signs

SIGN #07-019 CWF/Closet Envy/409 West Duke of Gloucester Street – Freestanding, Building Mounted & Awning Signage

There were no questions or comments from the Board regarding the cases on the Consent Agenda, but Victor Smith from the audience asked that **ARB #07-026 Anderson & Cumber/627 Powell Street – Fence** be removed for questions. Mr. Edwards moved that the remaining cases on the consent agenda be approved as submitted. Mr. Hertzler seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 5-0 except for ARB Sign #07-019 and ARB #07-027 when the vote was 3-0-2.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye:	Edwards, Lane, Kent, Hertzler, Quarles
Nay:	None
Abstain:	Edwards from ARB Sign #07-019, and Hertzler from ARB #07-027
Absent:	Klee, Spence

ARCHITECTURAL PRESERVATION DISTRICT

ARB #07-015 Sun Trust Bank/202 North Henry Street – New Bank Building & Demolition of Existing Bank Building – Approved with Conditions

J.P. Vaughn with Baskervill, representing SunTrust Bank, said he has had a meeting with Ed Chappell, Director of Architectural Research at the Colonial Williamsburg Foundation and discussed the following revisions:

- Front elevation – pull main and wing windows up
- Rear elevation – mechanical screen will be brick with ventilation holes made by leaving 3” gaps in the brick
- West elevation -- change the pitch of the drive-thru canopy to a 6/12 pitch that will match the roof of the front pediment

Mr. Vaughn showed the Board a sample of a synthetic slate material the applicant would like to use. The proposed product is rubber and has a 50 year warranty.

Mr. Lane said he liked the original slope of the roof in the drive-thru design better than that proposed tonight. Regarding the synthetic slate roof, the Board recently approved the synthetic material on a Newport Avenue house and it looks awful. Mr. Vaughn agreed that some of the synthetic materials are not as good as others, but from a distance it's hard to tell the difference between the real and the synthetic roofs. He said the cost and weight of other than synthetic materials is a disadvantage, however, the applicant will accept the Board's decision. Mr. Hertzler noted that with a little age, the appearance is that of a rubber tire. If this occurs in a two to three year span, imagine what it would look like in 25 years. The sheen is a big concern. He added that this is a highly visible, critical area and Colonial Williamsburg has done an excellent job with concrete or slate shingles; the roof needs to be either slate or concrete shingles.

Vice-Chairman Quarles asked if the Board had any other major concerns in addition to the synthetic shingles. Mr. Hertzler said the windows and the mechanical screening

changes are good ones, but he has a different view on the drive-thru because he prefers the lower pitched roof. Mr. Kent stated that the dormers on the south elevation are small, and asked if they are the same width as the dormers on the first floor. Mr. Vaughn responded that in talking with Ed Chappell and going round and round on this issue, Mr. Chappell feels they should be smaller.

Mr. Hertzler moved that the proposal be approved with the revisions submitted tonight, contingent on the use of either slate or concrete shingles. Mr. Lane seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 4-0-1.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye:	Lane, Kent, Hertzler, Quarles
Nay:	None
Abstain:	Edwards
Absent:	Spence, Klee

ARB #07-017 Armistead House, LLC/320 North Henry Street - Exterior Changes (ADA ramp, porch rails and enclosed stairs) –Approved with Conditions

Michael Nordstrom, minority partner in Armistead House, LLC, stated that he is returning tonight having made the changes suggested by the Board at the March 27 meeting. He noted the letter he has written explaining the changes which is in Board members' packets. Mr. Nordstrom said the wheelchair lift will be on the south side behind the side porch. Mr. Edwards confirmed that the lift can be folded up and put in storage. There will be a fence and gate where the porch connects to the lift.

Mr. Nordstrom said that although they hope the house is found to be eligible for the National Register, just in case it is not approved, they would like to have the option of installing a more energy efficient window. Mr. Edwards said he cannot support a change in the windows; they need to be repaired; he added that he has done this on his house. Mrs. Murphy confirmed that the Board is within its purview to require no window replacement if the structure is eligible for listing on the National Register; there is a list of criteria if a structure is eligible in the ***Design Review Guidelines***.

Mr. Nordstrom reiterated that if the house is not eligible for the Register, they would like the option of replacement. Mr. Hertzler said the windows are a huge element and regarding the energy efficiency issue as well as soundproofing, he strongly recommends interior storm windows. Mr. Lane suggested the application of a 3M film that would make the windows safety glass. It was confirmed that the use of Pella windows on the new addition is approved.

Mr. Nordstrom noted that the balusters have been changed to a plain square shape, however, rather than using the square shaped balusters, Mr. Edwards said he would like to see slats similar to other 18th Century buildings in town. He said the slats would

fit in better with the Victorian house. Mr. Nordstrom responded that he has no problem with the change to slats. Mrs. Murphy suggested the Board approve this in concept so that the applicant is able to stay on schedule to go to City Council in May for a special use permit.

Vice-Chairman Quarles asked if the Board felt the submittal tonight addressed their concerns, and the consensus of the Board was that they were addressed; the only remaining issue is that of the replacement windows. Mr. Hertzler said he would prefer a replica of what is currently there, and suggested the applicant check the website, "historic wood windows", where he will find a good number of manufacturers. Mr. Hertzler stated that the proposed use of the structure is an inn, and part of the experience when staying in such an inn is enjoying the building itself. He suggested window repair would be an investment because it would enhance the visitor's experience. Mr. Nordstrom commented that it will be hard to see the windows when inside because there will be heavy Victorian draperies covering most of them. Mrs. Murphy confirmed that if interior storm windows are installed the applicant does not need to return to the Board; however, exterior storm windows would require Board approval.

Mr. Quarles moved that the request be approved as submitted with the exception that the windows will not be replaced and the use of the slats proposed by Mr. Edwards will be an option. Also, new Pella windows are approved to use for the addition. Mr. Lane seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 5-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye:	Edwards, Lane, Kent, Hertzler, Quarles
Nay:	None
Absent:	Spence, Klee

ARB #07-024 Newell/220 North Henry Street – Exterior Change (asphalt shingle to standing seam metal roof) – Tabled

ARB #07-024 was tabled because there was no representative present.

ARB #07-026 Anderson & Cumber/627 Powell Street – Fence – Tabled

No representative was present for this case and Board consensus was to table; however, because there were several people in the audience present in response to the publicized public hearing, Mr. Quarles opened the public hearing.

In response to a question from Victor Smith, 140 Chandler Court, Mrs. Murphy said the proposed six foot privacy fence is to be cedar and finished on both sides. Mr. Smith was concerned that if the fence is installed as the site plan shows, many trees will need to be taken down and they would have to go through the adjacent property of the Christian Scientist Church to haul them away. He also asked if the Board can require

screening appropriate to avoid a tunnel effect. Mr. Smith mentioned that it is about time for the power company to come along and cut trees back from power lines. Mrs. Murphy clarified that the Board's purview is to ensure the appropriate appearance of the fence. Members of the audience said they would like to have a meeting with the applicant to clarify the proposal.

Mr. Smith concluded discussion by saying that one of his concerns is that he has experienced both the Planning Commission and the City Council dismisses aspects of a proposal with the statement that "the Architectural Review Board will take care of that element". He said there needs to be a clear delineation of areas of purview while our town is being further developed.

The proposal was tabled by a consensus of the Board.

ARB #07-028 Sheraton Four Points/351 York Street – Renovate entrance canopy to restaurant was approved under the consent agenda.

CORRIDOR PROTECTION DISTRICT

Cases under the consent agenda: **ARB #07-018 Bloom's/1234 Richmond Road – Exterior Change (add door and window)** and **ARB #07-027 Three Olives Restaurant/1203 Richmond Road – Addition (patio)**

SIGNS

ARB

SIGN #07-017 Bourbon Street Bar & Grille/351 York Street – Monument Sign – Approved Option B

Mrs. Murphy noted that the *Design Review Guidelines* state that a proposal for a sign with more than three colors needs to be reviewed on a case-by-case basis and this proposal has five colors counting the cabinet color.

The applicant's representative, Christopher Aiken with Images in Art Signs and Graphics, stated that he comes to the Board with three color options for the sign. The three options have various combinations of colors for the lettering, but in all three options the background is opaque burgundy.

The Board discussed the number of colors and the different options presented. Mr. Hertzler noted that the dark green and burgundy combination gives a more somber appearance and suggested the gold for the filigree and the ampersand on a burgundy field would stand out better. Mr. Aiken responded that the owners would agree to this combination which is the one represented in Option B. Mr. Lane noted the four colors then would be burgundy, gold, white and black.

Mr. Hertzler moved that Option B be approved. Mr. Quarles seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 5-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Kent, Hertzler, Quarles
Nay: None
Absent: Spence, Klee

The remaining sign cases on the agenda were approved under the consent agenda:

SIGN #07-013 Sherran/Sotheby's International Realty – Freestanding Sign

SIGN #07-014 Katherine Circle Apartments/321 Dunning Street – Freestanding

SIGN #07-015 Patriot Inn & Suites/1420 Richmond Road – Monument & Building Mounted Signs

SIGN #07-016 6 Crabs Seafood/118 Second Street – Monument Sign

SIGN #07-018 Rita's/220-D Monticello Avenue – Building Mounted Signs

SIGN #07-019 CWF/Closet Envy/409 West Duke of Gloucester Street – Freestanding, Building Mounted & Awning Signage

OTHER

Minutes for March 27, 2007

Mr. Hertzler moved that the minutes for the March 27, 2007 meeting be approved. Mr. Edwards seconded the motion which carried viva voce.

There being no further business the meeting adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

Dee Scott
Secretary